The Impact of Plant-Based and Animal-Based Protein Recovery Drinks On Sport Performance: A Comparative Review

Ankit Singh[1], Dilip Tirkey[2]

[1]Research Scholar, Lakshmibai National Institute of Physical Education
[2]Associate Professor, Lakshmibai National Institute of Physical Education

Abstract
Protein recovery drinks are essential for athletes to enhance muscle recovery and improve overall sport performance. This review compares the effectiveness of plant-based and animal-based protein recovery drinks, examining their roles in muscle recovery, strength, and endurance. While both types of proteins offer significant benefits, differences in amino acid profiles, digestibility, and other factors may influence their effectiveness. This review aims to provide a comprehensive analysis to guide athletes in choosing the most suitable protein recovery drink for their needs.

Introduction
The role of protein in sports recovery is well-established, with numerous studies highlighting its importance in muscle repair, synthesis, and overall performance enhancement. Protein recovery drinks have become a popular choice among athletes for their convenience and effectiveness. This review focuses on comparing plant-based and animal-based protein recovery drinks, highlighting their impact on various aspects of sport performance.

Methods
A comprehensive literature search was conducted using databases such as PubMed, Google Scholar, and Web of Science. Keywords included "plant-based protein recovery," "animal-based protein recovery," "sports performance," "protein supplements," and "recovery drinks." Inclusion criteria encompassed studies published in the last decade, randomized controlled trials, and articles directly relevant to the comparison of plant-based and animal-based proteins in sports recovery.

Recovery drinks
Recovery drinks are specialized beverages designed to help athletes recover more effectively after intense exercise or competition. They typically contain a mix of carbohydrates, proteins, electrolytes, and sometimes other nutrients, each serving a specific purpose in the recovery process. Here's a breakdown of what recovery drinks are and how they are used in athletic performance:

Components of Recovery Drinks:
1. **Carbohydrates**:
    - Replenish glycogen stores in muscles that have been depleted during exercise.
    - Provide energy for post-exercise recovery processes.
2. **Proteins**:
    - Support muscle repair and growth by providing amino acids needed for protein synthesis.

- Help reduce muscle soreness and accelerate muscle recovery.

3. **Electrolytes**:
   - Replace essential minerals (like sodium, potassium, magnesium) lost through sweat.
   - Maintain fluid balance and prevent dehydration.
4. **Vitamins and Antioxidants**:
   - Reduce oxidative stress caused by intense physical activity.
   - Support overall immune function, helping athletes recover faster.

5. **Fats** (sometimes included):
   - Provide a sustained energy source.
   - Support overall nutrient absorption.

Uses in athletic performance:

1. **Muscle Recovery**:
   - Recovery drinks are essential for repairing muscle damage caused by intense exercise. The protein content helps rebuild muscle fibres, while carbohydrates restore energy levels, both critical for athletes aiming to train consistently without prolonged soreness or injury.
2. **Glycogen Replenishment**:
   - Glycogen is the stored form of glucose in muscles and is the primary energy source during exercise. After intense physical activity, glycogen stores are depleted. Recovery drinks rich in carbohydrates help to quickly replenish these stores, ensuring that athletes are ready for their next training session or competition.
3. **Hydration**:
   - Athletes lose significant amounts of fluids and electrolytes through sweat. Recovery drinks that include electrolytes help restore this balance, preventing cramps, dehydration, and electrolyte imbalances, which can impair performance.
4. **Reduction of Muscle Soreness**:
   - The combination of proteins and other anti-inflammatory ingredients in recovery drinks can help reduce muscle soreness (DOMS - Delayed Onset Muscle Soreness), making it easier for athletes to maintain their training schedule.
5. **Immune System Support**:
   - Intense exercise can temporarily suppress the immune system, making athletes more susceptible to illness. Some recovery drinks include vitamins and antioxidants that support immune function, helping to protect athletes during recovery periods.
6. **Enhanced Adaptation to Training**:
   - Regular consumption of recovery drinks can support the body's adaptation to training by ensuring that recovery is efficient, allowing for more frequent and intense training sessions over time.

Types of recovery drinks:

1. **Carbohydrate-Protein Blends**: Commonly used post-exercise to provide a balanced ratio of carbs and proteins, aiding both energy replenishment and muscle repair.
2. **Electrolyte Drinks**: Focus on replenishing fluids and electrolytes lost through sweat, particularly useful after prolonged or intense endurance activities.
3. **Protein Shakes**: Primarily used for muscle repair, often favoured by strength athletes or those engaging in high-intensity interval training (HIIT).

4. **Plant-Based Recovery Drinks**: These are gaining popularity among vegan athletes and those with dietary restrictions. They typically use proteins derived from sources like peas, soy, or rice, and include other plant-based nutrients.

When to Use Recovery Drinks:

1. **Immediately After Exercise**: The 30-60 minute window post-exercise is often referred to as the "golden hour" for recovery, when muscles are most receptive to nutrient intake.
2. **During Long Events**: For endurance athletes, recovery drinks might be consumed during prolonged events to maintain energy levels and hydration.
3. **As Part of Daily Nutrition**: Some athletes incorporate recovery drinks into their daily nutrition regimen to ensure they meet their protein and carbohydrate needs consistently.

Protein sources:

Plant-based proteins such as soya, pea, rice, and hemp are commonly used in recovery drinks. These proteins are praised for their sustainability and are often chosen by individuals with dietary restrictions or preferences.

The digestibility of plant-based recovery drinks is an important consideration for athletes and individuals who rely on these beverages for post-exercise recovery. The digestibility of a protein or other nutrient refers to how efficiently the body can break it down and absorb it. Here's a closer look at the factors influencing the digestibility of plant-based recovery drinks:

Factors Affecting Digestibility of Plant-Based Recovery Drinks:

1. **Protein Source**:
    - **Soy Protein**: Soy is one of the most common protein sources in plant-based recovery drinks. It has a relatively high digestibility and a complete amino acid profile, meaning it contains all nine essential amino acids. However, soy also contains anti-nutritional factors like trypsin inhibitors and phytic acid, which can reduce protein digestibility, although processing methods like fermentation can reduce these effects.
    - **Pea Protein**: Pea protein is another popular option. It has a high digestibility and is hypoallergenic, making it suitable for people with food sensitivities. While it lacks some amino acids like methionine, it is still considered a good protein source when combined with other plant proteins.
    - **Rice Protein**: Rice protein is often used in plant-based recovery drinks due to its hypoallergenic nature. It is easily digestible but is low in lysine, an essential amino acid. Blending rice protein with other sources can improve its amino acid profile and overall digestibility.
2. **Fibre Content**:
    - Many plant-based proteins are higher in fibre compared to animal proteins. While fibre is beneficial for overall digestive health, it can slow down the digestion and absorption of proteins. This means that while plant-based recovery drinks are often slower to digest, they may provide a more sustained release of amino acids, which could be beneficial for recovery.
3. **Anti-Nutritional Factors**:
    - **Phytic Acid**: Found in grains and legumes, phytic acid can bind to minerals like iron, zinc, and calcium, reducing their absorption. It can also inhibit digestive enzymes, potentially reducing protein digestibility. Processing methods such as soaking, sprouting, and fermenting can help reduce phytic acid levels.

- **Tannins and Lectins**: These compounds, found in some plant proteins, can interfere with protein digestion by inhibiting digestive enzymes or binding to proteins, making them harder to digest.

4. **Processing and Formulation**:
    - The processing of plant-based proteins can significantly affect their digestibility. Methods such as protein isolation, hydrolysis (breaking down proteins into smaller peptides), and fermentation can improve digestibility by removing or reducing anti-nutritional factors.
    - **Protein Blends**: Combining different plant proteins (e.g., rice and pea protein) in recovery drinks can enhance digestibility and provide a more complete amino acid profile, overcoming the limitations of individual plant proteins.
5. **Digestive Enzymes**:
    - Some plant-based recovery drinks include added digestive enzymes to help break down proteins and carbohydrates more efficiently, improving overall digestibility and nutrient absorption.

Comparison with Animal-Based Proteins:

- **Animal-Based Proteins**: Generally, animal proteins like whey and casein have higher digestibility and a more complete amino acid profile. Whey protein, for instance, is rapidly digested and absorbed, leading to quicker spikes in blood amino acid levels, which is advantageous for muscle recovery immediately post-exercise.
- **Plant-Based Proteins**: Although generally less digestible than animal-based proteins, the gap can be narrowed through careful selection of protein sources, processing, and formulation. Some plant-based proteins may have slower digestion and absorption rates, which can be beneficial for providing a steady supply of amino acids over a longer period, supporting sustained muscle repair.

Practical Implications:

- **For Athletes**: While plant-based recovery drinks may be slower to digest, they are still effective for muscle recovery, particularly if consumed as part of a balanced diet that includes a variety of protein sources. Athletes may benefit from consuming these drinks with other nutrient-dense foods or choosing formulations designed to enhance digestibility.
- **Dietary Considerations**: Plant-based recovery drinks are suitable for vegans, vegetarians, and those with dairy allergies or intolerances. They are also a good option for individuals looking to reduce their environmental footprint or support ethical dietary practices.

In conclusion, while plant-based recovery drinks may have slightly lower digestibility compared to animal-based options, they can still effectively support post-exercise recovery when properly formulated. Combining different plant proteins and using advanced processing techniques can improve their nutritional value and digestibility.

Animal-based proteins:

Animal-based proteins, particularly whey and casein, are the gold standard in protein supplementation due to their complete amino acid profile and high bioavailability. These proteins are derived from dairy and are widely studied for their efficacy in muscle recovery.

The digestibility of animal-based recovery drinks is a key factor that influences their effectiveness in supporting post-exercise recovery. Digestibility refers to how easily and efficiently the body can break down and absorb the nutrients, particularly proteins, from these beverages. Here's an overview of the digestibility of common animal-based recovery drinks:

Types of animal-based proteins in recovery drinks:

1. **Whey Protein**:
    - **High Digestibility**: Whey protein is one of the most easily digestible and quickly absorbed proteins. It has a biological value (BV) of 104, which means that a large proportion of the protein consumed is absorbed and utilized by the body.
    - **Rapid Absorption**: Whey is considered a "fast" protein, meaning it is rapidly digested and absorbed, leading to a quick spike in blood amino acid levels. This makes it particularly effective for immediate post-exercise recovery, promoting muscle protein synthesis soon after ingestion.
    - **Complete Amino Acid Profile**: Whey contains all nine essential amino acids in optimal proportions, making it a complete protein. It is especially rich in branched-chain amino acids (BCAAs) like leucine, which are crucial for muscle repair and growth.
2. **Casein Protein**:
    - **Moderate Digestibility**: Casein, another milk-derived protein, has a slower digestion rate compared to whey. It forms a gel-like substance in the stomach, leading to a slower release of amino acids into the bloodstream.
    - **Sustained Release**: Because of its slow digestion, casein provides a steady supply of amino acids over several hours, which can be beneficial for muscle maintenance during periods of fasting or between meals. This characteristic makes casein ideal for nighttime recovery.
    - **Complete Amino Acid Profile**: Like whey, casein also has a complete amino acid profile, supporting muscle repair and overall recovery.
3. **Egg Protein**:
    - **High Digestibility**: Egg protein, particularly egg white protein, is highly digestible with a biological value of around 100. This means it is well-utilized by the body and efficiently supports muscle repair and recovery.
    - **Moderate Absorption Rate**: Egg protein is absorbed at a moderate pace, making it a balanced option between the fast absorption of whey and the slow absorption of casein.
    - **Complete Amino Acid Profile**: Egg protein is also a complete protein, rich in essential amino acids and particularly high in leucine.
4. **Collagen Protein**:
    - **Moderate Digestibility**: Collagen protein, derived from animal connective tissues, has a unique amino acid profile that is rich in glycine, proline, and hydroxyproline but lacks certain essential amino acids, making it incomplete as a sole protein source.
    - **Absorption and Benefits**: While not typically used for muscle repair, collagen is highly digestible and is often included in recovery drinks for its benefits to joint health, skin elasticity, and connective tissue repair.

Advantages of Animal-Based Proteins in Recovery Drinks:

1. **Complete Amino Acid Profile**:
    - Animal-based proteins like whey, casein, and egg provide all essential amino acids, which are critical for muscle repair, growth, and overall recovery. This makes them more effective in supporting athletic performance compared to many plant-based proteins.
2. **Bioavailability**:
    - Animal proteins generally have higher bioavailability, meaning that a larger proportion of the ingested protein is absorbed and utilized by the body. This makes them more efficient in promoting recovery.

3. **Fast and Slow Protein Options**:
    - The combination of fast-digesting proteins like whey and slow-digesting proteins like casein allows athletes to tailor their recovery strategy. Whey can be used for immediate post-exercise recovery, while casein can provide a prolonged release of amino acids, supporting recovery during extended periods without food (e.g., overnight).

Practical implications:

1. **Post-Exercise Recovery**:
    - Whey protein is often recommended immediately after exercise due to its rapid digestibility and ability to quickly elevate blood amino acid levels, which is critical for muscle repair and glycogen replenishment.
2. **Sustained Recovery**:
    - Casein protein is ideal for sustained recovery, such as taking before bedtime, as it slowly releases amino acids throughout the night, preventing muscle breakdown and promoting recovery during sleep.
3. **Dietary Considerations**:
    - Animal-based proteins are typically well-tolerated by most people, but those with lactose intolerance may need to choose lactose-free whey or opt for other animal proteins like egg or collagen.
4. **Overall Performance**:
    - The high digestibility and complete amino acid profiles of animal-based recovery drinks make them highly effective in supporting athletic performance, helping athletes recover quickly and maintain their training intensity.

In summary, animal-based recovery drinks offer excellent digestibility, with proteins like whey providing rapid absorption and proteins like casein offering sustained amino acid release. This makes them highly effective for post-exercise recovery, muscle repair, and overall athletic performance.

Mechanisms of action:

Proteins aid in muscle recovery by providing essential amino acids necessary for muscle protein synthesis (MPS). Animal-based proteins, especially whey, are rapidly digested and rich in branched-chain amino acids (BCAAs), particularly leucine, which is crucial for MPS. Plant-based proteins, while sometimes lower in certain essential amino acids, can be combined to form a complete amino acid profile and effectively support MPS.

Comparison of effectiveness:

Muscle recovery

Studies indicate that both plant-based and animal-based proteins can support muscle recovery effectively. Whey protein has been shown to accelerate recovery due to its rapid digestion and high leucine content. However, recent research demonstrates that when plant-based proteins are consumed in sufficient quantities or in combination to ensure a complete amino acid profile, they can be equally effective in promoting muscle recovery.

Strength

Animal-based proteins, particularly whey, have been traditionally favored for strength gains due to their superior amino acid profile and digestibility. However, emerging evidence suggests that plant-based proteins, when consumed in adequate amounts and combined appropriately, can also support strength improvements comparably.

Endurance

Endurance athletes benefit from protein recovery drinks that aid in muscle repair and glycogen replenishment. Both plant-based and animal-based proteins can fulfill these roles. Some studies suggest that plant-based proteins might offer additional benefits such as improved antioxidant capacity and reduced inflammation, which are beneficial for endurance athletes.

Advantages and disadvantages:

Digestibility and absorption

Animal-based proteins generally have higher digestibility and are absorbed more efficiently compared to plant-based proteins. However, advancements in food technology have improved the digestibility of plant-based proteins.

Amino acid profile

Animal-based proteins are complete proteins, containing all essential amino acids in optimal proportions. Plant-based proteins may lack one or more essential amino acids but can be combined (e.g., rice and pea protein) to create a complete protein profile.

Allergenicity

Animal-based proteins, particularly dairy-derived proteins, can cause allergic reactions or intolerances in some individuals. Plant-based proteins are less likely to cause such issues, making them a preferable option for those with allergies or lactose intolerance.

Environmental impact

Plant-based proteins have a lower environmental footprint compared to animal-based proteins, aligning with sustainable and ethical food practices.

Limitations:

The current research on plant-based proteins is not as extensive as that on animal-based proteins. More high-quality studies are needed to fully understand the potential of plant-based proteins in sports recovery.

Discussion:

The review indicates that both plant-based and animal-based protein recovery drinks can effectively enhance sport performance, with specific benefits and limitations associated with each type. The choice between plant-based and animal-based proteins should consider factors such as dietary restrictions, allergenicity, and environmental impact.

Future directions:

Future research should focus on long-term studies comparing the effects of plant-based and animal-based proteins on various performance metrics. Investigating the synergistic effects of combining different plant-based proteins could also provide valuable insights.

Conclusion:

Both plant-based and animal-based protein recovery drinks offer substantial benefits for muscle recovery and sport performance. Athletes should consider their individual dietary needs, potential allergies, and environmental impact when choosing a protein recovery drink. Further research will continue to elucidate the comparative advantages of these protein sources.

References:

1. **Kang, H., & Park, I.** (2020). *Effects of Plant-Based Protein Intake on Muscle Mass and Strength in Active Individuals: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis*. Journal of Sports Science & Medicine, 19(4), 714-723.

2. **Nieman, D. C., Shanely, R. A., Luo, B., Dew, D. A., Meaney, M. P., & Sha, W.** (2013). *A commercialized dietary supplement alleviates joint pain in community adults: a randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled trial*. Clinical Journal of Sport Medicine, 23(5), 440-446.
3. **Joy, J. M., Lowery, R. P., Wilson, J. M., Purpura, M., De Souza, E. O., McQuillan, J. A., ... & Wilson, S. M.** (2013). *The effects of 8 weeks of whey or rice protein supplementation on body composition and exercise performance*. Nutrition Journal, 12(1), 1-7.
4. **Phillips, S. M., & Van Loon, L. J. C.** (2011). *Dietary protein for athletes: From requirements to optimum adaptation*. Journal of Sports Sciences, 29(sup1), S29-S38.
5. **Tang, J. E., Moore, D. R., Kujbida, G. W., Tarnopolsky, M. A., & Phillips, S. M.** (2009). *Ingestion of whey hydrolysate, casein, or soy protein isolate: effects on mixed muscle protein synthesis at rest and following resistance exercise in young men*. Journal of Applied Physiology, 107(3), 987-992.
6. **Wilborn, C. D., Taylor, L. W., Outlaw, J., Williams, L., Campbell, B., Foster, C. A., & Kreider, R. B.** (2013). *The Effects of Pre-and Post-Exercise Whey vs. Casein Protein Consumption on Body Composition and Performance Measures in Collegiate Female Athletes*. Journal of Sports Science & Medicine, 12(1), 74-79.
7. **Joy, J. M., Lowery, R. P., Wilson, J. M., Purpura, M., De Souza, E. O., McQuillan, J. A., ... & Wilson, S. M.** (2013). *The effects of 8 weeks of whey or rice protein supplementation on body composition and exercise performance*. Nutrition Journal, 12(1), 86. doi:10.1186/1475-2891-12-86.
8. **Volek, J. S., Volk, B. M., Gómez, A. L., Kunces, L. J., Kupchak, B. R., Freidenreich, D. J., ... & Kraemer, W. J.** (2013). *Whey protein supplementation during resistance training augments lean body mass*. Journal of the American College of Nutrition, 32(2), 122-135.
9. **Gorissen, S. H., Horstman, A. M., Franssen, R., Crombag, J. J., Langer, H., Bierau, J., & van Loon, L. J.** (2016). *Ingestion of wheat protein increases in vivo muscle protein synthesis rates in healthy older men in a randomized trial*. The Journal of Nutrition, 146(9), 1651-1659.
10. **Lynch, H. M., Wharton, C. M., & Johnston, C. S.** (2018). *Plant-Based Diets: Considerations for Environmental Impact, Protein Quality, and Exercise Performance*. Nutrients, 10(12), 1841. doi:10.3390/nu10121841. This article discusses the environmental impact and protein quality differences between plant-based and animal-based diets, as well as their implications for exercise performance.
11. **Van Vliet, S., Burd, N. A., & van Loon, L. J. C.** (2015). *The Skeletal Muscle Anabolic Response to Plant- versus Animal-Based Protein Consumption*. The Journal of Nutrition, 145(9), 1981-1991. doi:10.3945/jn.114.204305. This paper compares the anabolic responses of skeletal muscle to plant-based versus animal-based proteins, providing insights into their relative efficacy for muscle recovery.
12. **Rogerson, D.** (2017). *Vegan diets: practical advice for athletes and exercisers*. Journal of the International Society of Sports Nutrition, 14(1), 36. doi:10.1186/s12970-017-0192-9. This article offers a detailed comparison of the benefits and challenges of vegan (plant-based) diets for athletes, including considerations for protein intake and recovery.
13. **Gilani, G. S., Xiao, C. W., & Cockell, K. A.** (2012). *Impact of antinutritional factors in food proteins on the digestibility of protein and the bioavailability of amino acids and on protein quality*. British Journal of Nutrition, 108(S2), S315-S332. doi:10.1017/S0007114512002371. This paper discusses how antinutritional factors in plant proteins can impact their digestibility and amino acid bioavailability compared to animal proteins.
14. **Tang, J. E., Moore, D. R., Kujbida, G. W., Tarnopolsky, M. A., & Phillips, S. M.** (2009). *Ingestion of whey hydrolysate, casein, or soy protein isolate: effects on mixed muscle protein synthesis at rest and following resistance exercise in young men*. Journal of Applied Physiology, 107(3), 987-992. doi:10.1152/japplphysiol.00076.2009. This study compares the effects of whey (animal-based) and soy

(plant-based) protein on muscle protein synthesis, highlighting differences in digestion and absorption rates.

15. **Rutherfurd, S. M., Fanning, A. C., Miller, B. J., &Moughan, P. J.** (2015). *Protein digestibility-corrected amino acid scores and digestible indispensable amino acid scores differentially describe protein quality in growing male rats*. The Journal of Nutrition, 145(2), 372-379. doi:10.3945/jn.114.195438. This paper provides insights into the digestibility and quality of different proteins, including plant-based and animal-based, which can affect recovery.
16. **Campbell, B., Kreider, R. B., Ziegenfuss, T., La Bounty, P., Roberts, M., Burke, D., ... & Antonio, J.** (2007). *International Society of Sports Nutrition position stand: protein and exercise*. Journal of the International Society of Sports Nutrition, 4(1), 8. doi:10.1186/1550-2783-4-8. This position stand discusses the impact of different protein sources, including plant and animal-based proteins, on various health markers, including blood profiles, in athletes.
17. **Phillips, S. M., Tang, J. E., & Moore, D. R.** (2009). *The role of milk- and soy-based protein in support of muscle protein synthesis and muscle protein accretion in young and elderly persons*. The American Journal of Clinical Nutrition, 89(5), 1582S-1587S. doi:10.3945/ajcn.2009.26736X. This paper compares the effects of milk (animal-based) and soy (plant-based) proteins on muscle protein synthesis and other health indicators, including blood profiles, in athletes.
18. **Craddock, J. C., Probst, Y. C., & Peoples, G. E.** (2016). *Effect of dairy proteins on biomarkers of inflammation: a systematic review of randomized controlled trials*. Nutrients, 8(3), 131. doi:10.3390/nu8030131. This systematic review discusses how dairy proteins (animal-based) influence inflammation and other blood markers, providing insights into their effects compared to plant-based proteins.
19. **Joy, J. M., Lowery, R. P., Wilson, J. M., Purpura, M., De Souza, E. O., McQuillan, J. A., ... & Wilson, S. M.** (2013). *The effects of 8 weeks of whey or rice protein supplementation on body composition and exercise performance*. Nutrition Journal, 12(1), 86. doi:10.1186/1475-2891-12-86. This study compares the effects of whey (animal-based) and rice (plant-based) protein supplements on body composition and exercise performance, including recovery times.
20. **Tang, J. E., Moore, D. R., Kujbida, G. W., Tarnopolsky, M. A., & Phillips, S. M.** (2009). *Ingestion of whey hydrolysate, casein, or soy protein isolate: effects on mixed muscle protein synthesis at rest and following resistance exercise in young men*. Journal of Applied Physiology, 107(3), 987-992. doi:10.1152/japplphysiol.00076.2009. This paper compares the effects of whey (animal-based) and soy (plant-based) proteins on muscle protein synthesis rates, which are closely tied to recovery speed.
21. **Wilkinson, S. B., Tarnopolsky, M. A., Macdonald, M. J., Macdonald, J. R., Armstrong, D., & Phillips, S. M.** (2007). *Consumption of fluid skim milk promotes greater muscle protein accretion after resistance exercise than does consumption of an isonitrogenous and isoenergetic soy-protein beverage*. The American Journal of Clinical Nutrition, 85(4), 1031-1040. doi:10.1093/ajcn/85.4.1031. This study investigates the differences in muscle protein accretion and recovery between animal-based milk and plant-based soy protein beverages after resistance exercise